



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

unfair. That between 1,000 and 1,200 students should study Latin grammar, elementary prose composition, Caesar, Cicero, and Vergil for the time required in the secondary schools and make as poor a showing on examinations which have been carefully scrutinized makes the question of decision an easy one. The fault lies in the combination of methods and requirements or it lies in the organization of the schools and in the feeling which prompts numerous parents to have their children study Latin when they are mentally unqualified for it.

The thoughts evoked by Mr. Hopkins's paragraph are the more insistent because in the same number of *The Atlantic Monthly* is an article by Dr. Edmiston on Classical Education in America in which he excoriates the aims and methods pursued here, holding up as a terrible example his own experience. It would be too mild to say that he has no words of commendation for our system. He has really no words strong enough to characterize what he regards as its utter futility. He expressly declines to suggest any definite measures of relief, which is a pity because in the multitude of suggestions there lies the possibility of a solution.

Meanwhile, however, it would be well for classical teachers everywhere to ponder the results of the College Board examinations. Such results are not new in their experiences, but their publication may stimulate them to action. G. L.

Vergil's Debt

to the

Hecuba and Troades of Euripides.

(Concluded from Page 52)

The cry of Aeneas (1.94-99)

O terque quarterque beati,
quis ante ora patrum Troiae sub moenibus altis
contigit opetere!

saevus ubi Aeacidæ telo iacet Hector

is the thought of Cassandra (Troades 386-389)

Τρῶες δὲ πρῶτον μὲν, τὸ κάλλιστον κλέος,
ὑπὲρ πάτρας ἔθνησκον· οὓς δ' ἔλοι δόρυ,
νεκροί γ' ἐξ οἴκου φερόμενοι φίλων ὕπο
ἐν γῇ πατρώα περιβολὰς εἶχον χθονός.

A choral ode of the Troades tells of the fatal horse and furnishes Vergil with more material for Aeneas's story. It begins with an invocation like Musa, mihi causas memora (Aen. 1.8), thus. (see Troades 511-514):

ἀμφί μοι Ἴλιον, ὦ
Μοῦσα, καινῶν ὕμνων
ἄεισον ἐν δακρύοις ᾠδὰν ἐπικήδειον.

Then follow Troades 519-521:

ἔλιπον ἵππον οὐράνια
βρέμοντα χρυσεοφάλαρον ἔνο—
πλον ἐν πύλαις Ἀχαιοί.

These verses are reproduced in Aen. 2.15, 20:

instar montis equum
uterumque armato milite complent.

A certain thought occurred to the Trojans of the Troades and to those of the Aeneid; compare Troades 524-526

Ἴτ', ὦ πεπανμένοι πόνων,
τόδ' ἱερὸν ἀνάγετε ξόανον
Ἰλιάδι Διογενεὶ Κόρα.

with Aen. 2.32,33

primusque Thymoetes
duci intra muros hortatur et arce locari.

In the play, as in the Aeneid, they prepared a joyful reception for the image; compare Troades 527-532, 537-541, 545-550

τίς οὐκ ἔβα νεανίδων,
τίς οὐ γεραῖος ἐκ δόμων ;
κεχαρμένοι δ' αἰοδαῖς
δόλιον ἔσχον ἄταν
πάντα δὲ γένηα Φρυγῶν
πρὸς πύλας ὤρμαθη.

κλωστοῦ δ' ἀμφιβόλοις λίνου ναὸς ὥσεί
σκάφος κελαιόν, εἰς ἔδρανα
λαίνα δάπεδά τε φόνια πατρί—
δι Παλλάδος θέσαν θεᾶς.

παρθένου δ'
ἀέριον ἀνὰ κρότον ποδῶν
βοᾶν ἔμελλον εὐφρον', ἐν
δόμοις δὲ παμφαῖς σέλας
πυρὸς μέλαιναν αἴγλαν
ἄκος ἔδωκεν ἦπνψ

with Aen. 2.235-237, 238-240, 245, 252-253:

Accingunt omnes operi, pedibusque rotarum
subiciunt lapsus, et stuppea vincula collo
intendunt.

Pueri circum innuptaeque puellae
sacra canunt, funemque manu contingere
gaudent.

Illa subit, mediaeque minans inlabitur urbi.

Et monstrum infelix sacra sistimus arce.

fusi per moenia Teucri
conticuere, sopor fessos complectitur artus:

In Troades 581, Andromache says πρὶν ποτ' ἦμεν ; in 1292 the chorus exclaims οὐδ' ἔτ' ἔστι Τροία and so in 2.325 Aeneas cries, fuit Ilium.

As one of the chief incidents of the Hecuba is the fate of Polyxena, so the Troades is concerned with the fates of Andromache, Astyanax and Cassandra. The wife of Hector tells her story (Troades 658-660):

ἐπεὶ γὰρ ἡρέθην
Ἀχιλλέως με παῖς ἐβουλήθη λαβεῖν
δάμαρτα δουλεύσῃ δ' ἐν αὐθεντῶν δόμοις.

Aeneas finds her in the land of Pyrrhus, where she says (3.325-327):

Nos, patria incensa, diversa per aequora vectae,
stirpis Achilleae fastus iuvenemque superbum
servitio enixae, tulimus . . .

Astyanax, by order of the Greeks, was torn from his mother's arms and cast from the wall of Troy. The parting of Andromache with her son and Hecuba's reception of his dead body are agonizing scenes of the Troades. Vergil refers to the fate of Astyanax in the words of Andromache to Ascanius (3.488-491):

Cape dona extrema tuorum,
O mihi sola mei super Astyanactis imago:
sic oculos, sic ille manus, sic ora ferebat;
et nunc aequali tecum pubesceret aevo.

In Troades 69 Cassandra's story is begun by Athena who complains to Poseidon:

οὐκ οἶσθ' ὑβρισθεῖσάν με καὶ ναοὺς ἐμούς;

Poseidon answers (70):

οἶδ', ἥνικ' Αἴας εἶλκε Κασάνδραν βίᾳ.

In Aen. 1.39-41 Juno, in a similar mood, refers to this:

Pallasne exurere classem
Argivom atque ipsos potuit submergere ponto,
unius ob noxam et furias Aiacis Oilei?

Hecuba dreads to see Cassandra meet the Greeks because of her madness (Troades 169-172):

μή νύν μοι τὰν
ἐκβακχεύουσαν Κασάνδραν,
αἰσχύναν Ἀργείοισιν,
πέμψητ' ἔξω,
μαινάδ', ἐπ' ἄλγει δ' ἄλγυνθῶ.

Talthybius replies to the anxious inquiry of Hecuba that Agamemnon has chosen Cassandra for his bride. At this impiety Hecuba exclaims (Troades 253-254):

ἦ τὰν τοῦ Φοίβου παρθένον, ᾧ γέρας ὁ
χρυσοκόμας ἔδωκ' ἀλεκτρον ῥόαν;

But Cassandra sings a wedding hymn and bids her mother rejoice, for by this marriage shall Troy be avenged. Then she predicts dire misfortunes for the Greeks, and, through her agency, the death of Agamemnon with all its attendant woes. But Talthybius speaks gently because of the curse upon her (Troades 408-410, 417-419):

εἰ μή σ' Ἀπόλλων ἐξεβάκχενεν φρένας
οὐ τὰν ἄμισθι τοὺς ἐμούς στρατηλάτας
τοιαῦσδε φήμαις ἐξέπεμψες ἂν χθονός.

καὶ σοὶ μὲν—οὐ γὰρ ἄρτίας ἔχεις φρένας—
Ἀργεῖ' ὄνειδῃ καὶ Φρυγῶν ἐπαινεῖσαι
ἀνέμοις φέρεσθαι παραδίδωμι.

Aeneas has the same thought (2.246-247):

Tunc etiam fatis aperit Cassandra futuris
ora, dei iussu non umquam credita Teucris.

He adds the story of her betrothal to Coroeus and the picture of her capture when she was dragged by the hair from the temple of Minerva.

To Euripides war meant not the joy and the glory of the victors, but the sorrows and wretchedness of the vanquished. "The consummation of a great conquest is in truth a great misery", says Professor Murray in the preface of his translation of the Troades, and later, in the same introductory note, he declares that the Trojan Women "is perhaps, in European literature, the first great expression of the spirit of pity for mankind exalted into a moving principle". The Aeneid is another expression of this principle. In both are the homesick longing of the exile, grief for the loss of friends and country, horror for the helpless fate of the women allotted as slaves to the victors.

The women are part of the spoil (Troades 28-29)

πολλοὶς δὲ κωκυτοῖσιν αἰχμαλωτῖδων
βοᾷ Σκάμανδρος δεσπότης κληρουμένων.

Aeneas describes the treasure of Troy collected in a temple and guarded by Phoenix and Ulysses (2.766-767):

pueri et pavidae longo ordine matres
stant circum.

The chorus of Trojan Women is full of fears as to its fate (Troades 161-162, 183-191):

. ἦ πού μ' ἤδη
νανοθλώσουσιν πατρίας ἐκ γᾶς;
Chorus: ἐκπληχθεῖσ' ἦλθον φρίκα.
ἦδη τις ἔβα Δαναῶν κήρυξ;
τῷ πρόσκειμαι δοῦλα τλάμων.

Hecuba: ἐγγύς που κείσαι κλήρον.

Chorus: ἰὼ ἰὼ
τίς μ' Ἀργείων ἢ Φθιωτᾶν.
ἦ νησαίαν μ' ἄξει χώραν
δύστανον πόρσω Τροίας;

Hecuba: φεῦ φεῦ

τῷ δ' ἂ τλάμων
ποῦ πᾶ γαίᾳ δουλεύσω γραῦς;

Talthybius, the herald, is greeted with breathless questions (Troades 244-245):

τίν' ἄρα τίς ἔλαχε; τίνα πότμος εὐτυχῆς
Ιλιάδων μένει;

This is the thought of Andromache in Aen. 3.321-324:

O felix una ante alias Priameia virgo,
hostilem ad tumulum Troiae sub moenibus altis
iussa mori, quae sortitus non pertulit ullos,
nec victoris eri tetigit captiva cubile!

Creusa consoles her husband for her loss by saying (2.785-786)

Non ego Myrmidonum sedes Dolopumve superbas
aspiciam aut Graiis servitum matribus ibo.

Pitiful farewells are said in Troades 173-174, 1092-1093, 1100-1106:

Τροία, Τροία δύσταν', ἔρρεις,
δύστανοι δ' οἱ σ' ἐκλείποντες.

Μᾶτερ, ὦμοι, μόναν δὴ μ' Ἀχαιοὶ κομί—
ζουσι σέθεν ἀπ' ὀμμάτων.

εἶθ' — πῆσοι — πῦρ,
Ἰλιόθεν ὅτε με πολυδάκρυν
Ἑλλάδι λάτρευμα γᾶθεν ἐξορίζει.

With these we may compare Aen. 3.10-11:

Litora cum patriae lacrimans portusque relinquo
et campos, ubi Troia fuit; feror exsul in altum.

The thought is summed up in certain verses of
Professor Murray's translation of the Troades

And forth, lo, the women go,
The crown of War, the crown of Woe,
To bear the children of the foe,
And weep, weep for Ilion!

H. MAY JOHNSON.

EASTERN HIGH SCHOOL, Washington, D. C.

REJOINDERS

When a reviewer confines himself to facts, the author of the book reviewed can only be grateful for the attention bestowed upon his work. But when a reviewer takes a different course, it becomes not only the right but also the duty of the author to make answer. It is on the basis of these general principles that I submit the following considerations in answer to the review of my First Year Latin, published by Mr. B. W. Bradley in THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 3.38.

Mr. Bradley asserts first: "Most of the sentences in the exercises are not taken from ancient authors but are created". This is untrue. Relatively few of the sentences were created by me. My procedure was as follows: When I desired to use a word in an exercise, I took the Menge-Preuss Lexicon and hunted till I found a citation adapted to my purpose. The great bulk of the sentences were secured in this way. At times a word was changed, irrelevant words were omitted, or parts of two sentences were amalgamated into one, but I rarely attempted to create.

Mr. Bradley further proceeds to charge that in these alleged creations I display carelessness and a lack of true feeling for Latin. Thus he asserts that "we find non-Caesarian, unusual, or false connotation in the use of words". As examples he cites *castella ponere* (p. 92); *impetum ferre* (119); *custodiam tradidit* (145); *manu for multitudo* (155); *etiam for quoque* (181); *opus est copiam frumenti nancisci* (194). Let us take these up in order. *Castella ponere* is alleged by Mr. Bradley to be non-Caesarian, unusual, or false. On the other hand it is Caesarian and correct. One has but to turn to the Thesaurus Linguae Latinae to see that the expression is not unusual. Caesar uses it in B. C. 3.58.1, and this suggested to me its employment. Similarly

Mr. Bradley regards *impetum ferre* as non-Caesarian, unusual, or false. But this expression occurs no fewer than eleven times in Caesar alone, viz. B. G. 3.19.3; 4.35.2; 5.21.5; 6.8.6; B. C. 2.25.5, 34.3; 3.37.6, 51.2, 64.1, 93.2, 93.4. My sentence was based particularly on B. G. 5.21.5. *Custodiam tradidit* (the next object of Mr. Bradley's censure) is Caesarian, occurring B. C. 3.39.1 *isdem custodiam navium longarum tradidit*, which suggested my sentence at p. 145. In criticizing my use of *manu* (p. 155) Mr. Bradley says I ought to have used *multitudine*. He adds: "*manus* means an organized force; organization is a quality which Caesar does not usually attribute to the Gauls". This definition of *manus* will surprise many. The lexicons define the word as 'host', 'multitude', 'Schar', 'Haufen'. However, the best test for our purpose is Caesar's actual usage. In B. G. 5.39.3 we read *magna manu Eburones legionem oppugnare incipiunt*, on the basis of which I use the sentence *Galli cum magna manu hoc oppidum oppugnare coeperunt* (p. 155), condemned by Mr. Bradley as one of my non-Caesarian, unusual, or false creations. In B. G. 5.26.2 we have further, *magna manu ad castra oppugnatum venerunt*; so also 5.8.6, 27.8; 1.37.4; and often. According to Menge-Preuss, this sense of *manus* ('Schar', 'Haufen') is the predominant one in Caesar. In fact, they do not recognize the occurrence of the word in the sense claimed by Mr. Bradley. At p. 181, according to Mr. Bradley, I use *etiam* where I ought to have used *quoque*. *Redde etiam* are the words at issue. *Redde quoque*, however, is impossible here for the reason (familiar to most certainly) that *quoque* is not used by Caesar after verbs¹. Lest it be urged that Mr. Bradley means *redde obsides quoque*, let me say that that would not convey my meaning, as must be obvious to all. Post-positive *etiam*, by the way, is so common in Caesar and all the best classical Latin as to need no defence. At p. 194 I use the sentence: *opus est copiam frumenti nancisci*. For the phrase *copiam frumenti nancisci* see B. G. 7.32.1. For *opus est* with the infinitive see 7.54.1. The foregoing are illustrations cited by Mr. Bradley as showing that the sentences in my exercises are non-Caesarian, unusual, or false, and that my book is prepared without care or a true feeling for the Latin language. In other words, the very sentences and expressions which I have scrupulously taken from the great master of Latin prose himself are condemned. In effect what I am chidden for is that, having undertaken to write a book based on Caesar, I did not use Mr. Bradley's Latin instead of Caesar's. This attitude is continued in Mr. Bradley's criticism of the sentence (p. 165), *ipsa loci natura periculum repellebat*, although these are Caesar's *ipsissima verba*, having been taken from B. C. 1.79.2 (not

¹ In fact, *quoque* with finite verbs is practically, if not quite, unknown to classical Latin.